# Appendix A

**Terms of Reference**

**Assignment/Project Title:** INDEPENDENT VERIFICATION OF ODF STATUS IN PUNJAB

**Location: Punjab,** India

**Assignment Duration:** 19 Months (July 2018- January 2020)

1. **PROJECT BACKGROUND AND OBJECTIVES**

**1.1 Context**

Department of Water Supply and sanitation Govt. of Punjab is implementing Mission Swachh and Swasth Punjab Objective of the mission is to improve liveability in the villages by providing improved water and sanitation services .The cost of project is financed under world bank funded Punjab Water and sanitation sector Improvement Project .Under Sanitation component of the project the improved IHHL latrines are being provided and demand for safe sanitation is being created through behavioural change program . The objectives under sanitation component are

* Ensure all the villages achieve open defecation free (ODF) status and adopting best sanitation practices in the field of Solid and Liquid waste management (SLWM).
* Increase sanitation coverage by creating demand for sanitation.
* Increasing mass awareness level and make the identified target population aware about issues related to hygiene and sanitation

The state of Punjab has achieved considerable progress under this component .Access to latrines has increased to 86.5% and 62% villages have been declared as Open defecation free by Panchayats .The state has adopted 7 step by step ODF verification protocol. According this protocol there is requirement to verify ODF status as of villages by employing state level ODF verification agencies. This TOR has been prepared to hire independent agencies to verify ODF status of villages

**1.2 SBM Campaign**

The Government of India launched the flagship program, Swachh Bharat Mission - Gramin [(SBM (G)], on 2nd October 2014. This program represents a renewed commitment to accelerate efforts towards achieving an open defecation free (ODF) and clean rural India, by 2nd October 2019. The programme is being implemented as a centrally sponsored scheme with shared funding between Centre and States.

Mission Swachh Punjab under the aegis of Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) focuses on achievement of a clean and healthy state by ensuring all the villages achieving Open Defecation Free (ODF) by 2018 and sustains the ODF status thereafter.

**1.3 ODF Verification Process**

The state has not just focused on achieving physical targets of SBM but also ensuring sustained behaviour change for bringing health impacts. Therefore, the state has accorded paramount importance to the processes of ODF verification protocols as a step to monitor and ensure sustenance of ODF outcomes. The ODF protocol of the Punjab will now have seven steps as detailed below.

1. **ODF Declaration:** Declaration of ODF will be done by respective Gram Panchayats once they are satisfied that they achieved ODF status.
2. **21 days of nigrani /21 days of Muniyadi/telecalling :** This is to ensure ODF declared GPs are not forgotten and regular follow up activities are undertaken to sustain behaviour change.
3. **First Verification:** This will be done after one month and before three months from the date of declaration, by non SBM officials to be engaged by Deputy Commissioner.
4. **Sustainability Verification:** This will be done after six months from the first verification or nine months from the date of declaration. In Punjab, this verification will also be undertaken by non SBM officials selected by Deputy Commissioner.
5. **Media Advertisement:** Once all villages in a district are declared as ODF, district administration will advertise that all villages in district have been declared ODF. Any of the citizens can raise observations or complaints to the administration before a given date.
6. **Random Verification by Eminent Personalities:** After the media advertisement, and before declaring the district ODF, Deputy Commissioner will select and send a team of eminent personalities to random villages to be sure about the sustenance of ODF status.
7. **State level Independent verification:** This will be done on annual basis every year covering all districts. This will provide an independent analysis of ODF outcomes based on a systematic sample study.

**1.4 Objective**

The purpose of this ToR is to appoint a reputed and independent verification agency to conduct two rounds of annual survey covering all districts starting in 2018-19. Each round of the survey shall be completed in three months. The objective of the assignment is to develop reliable data to monitor and ensure sustenance of ODF outcomes. This is designed to serve as a robust system for annual verification of ODF outcomes and results will be representative at state and district levels. This will be a once-a-year, state wide survey effort focused on ODF outcomes and sustenance.

1. **SCOPE OF WORK**

The assignment is divided into two annual surveys and the agency shall be responsible for the following tasks.

**2.1 Inception Report:** The agency shall submit an inception report detailing the management structures, implementation arrangements, sampling plan, survey instruments, work plan and quality assurance measures for conducting the survey and its analysis.

**2.2 Finalize Sampling:** The agency shall develop a sampling plan which shall ensure the following

* The sample shall be representative at the district level ensuring minimum 95% confidence level, using statistical methods. Number of villages and households to be covered in each district to be identified based on total villages and population of each district, as per the data of the department.
* The sample shall include around 1000 villages every year, covering all districts. In each village stratified sampling shall be undertaken to cover minimum 10 households that gained access to sanitation under the current project. Villages with less than 10 such households shall be excluded from the sample universe. In each village one focus group discussion shall also be undertaken to capture qualitative information about the process of the campaign.
* In each selected village, listing of households shall be done which shall include all households even those found locked. Based on the listing and the stratification based on socio economic classes, a minimum of 23 households shall be randomly sampled using software to avoid human biases. 23 sample includes three buffer sample to address absence of respondents during field survey. Only the first 20 samples that are completed in each sample village shall be used for analysis of results.
* In each selected village listing of all schools, anganwadi and public toilets shall be done. Based on the listing and using a software one sample of school, one sample of angnawadi and one sample of public toilet shall be randomly selected for survey.

**2.3 Finalize Data Collection Instruments:** The agency shall be responsible for the design of data collection instruments, translation, pre-testing, and finalization by incorporating inputs from the relevant stakeholders. The following survey instruments are proposed for use for the survey

1. *Household Listing:* This will produce the sampling-frame to select households from, the selected village;
2. *Household Survey:* This will collect information on self-reported household level sanitation arrangements, defecation practices of each usual resident, availability and safety of sanitation facilities accessible to the household, and associated practices e.g. handling/ disposal of infant feces, where applicable.
3. *Village Survey*: This will collect information on any visible signs of open defecation and visible accumulated solid/liquid waste; and availability, functionality and usage of toilets in schools and anganwadis.

It is up to the institute whether to use paper based questionnaire or electronic questionnaire using tablet/mobile considering the timeline of three months. In either case agency shall budget cost required for developing instruments and analyzing data.

A sample questionnaire shall be prepared by the consultant in consultation with department.

**2.4 Deployment of Team**: The agency shall specify the following teams: Dedicated agency personnel to be available during the entire period of each annual survey. This team should comprise the Project Coordinator/Team Leader, Statistician/ Data Management Specialist, at least three Field Coordinators (for managing Quality Assurance and coordination with survey teams), and one Data Analyst. Minimum requirements of qualification for key personnel are given in section 3.2, and the agency may propose an enhanced team with justifications. The agency will deploy field survey teams that will carry out field data collection, including but not restricted to, household listing, household and institutions’ surveys, and collecting observation-based data from households, institutions and village locations. The proposal shall indicate the system of deployment of investigators and supervisors for field data collection, back-checks, and quality assurance.

**2.5 Training:** The agency shall be responsible for conducting training on the verification protocol, data collection instruments, data capture and electronic upload, quality assurance, and protocols including field trial runs in non-sample villages. The agency shall produce and administer training manuals, duly translated as required. The Proposal shall present details of methods of recruitment, training, selection and supervision of survey team members.

**2.6 Data Collection and Reporting:** The agency shall be responsible for the following

* Real time validated household and village level data shall be made available for regular scrutiny, uploaded/entered in electronic format, within 24 hours of completion of data collection in a village
* Weekly status snapshot with numbers of households and villages completed and regular reports on validation checks undertaken by the agency. It may be ensured that the weekly snap-shot provides the following information with evidence -

1. Number of households, villages and public institutions/anganwadi’s/schools completed
2. Names of villages and public institutions/anganwadi’s/schools that have been visited
3. Report on validation checks undertaken, issues found and corrective measures undertaken

* Raw data and completed databases of all data collected along with relevant documentation including a photograph taken on mobile phone will be presented after 50 percent of the survey is completed
* Report on the village survey with dates of fieldwork, listing of sample households, and record of any substitution of households that may have been required along with reasons for the same, will be presented in the draft final report.

**2.7 Data Processing and Analysis Systems:** The agency shall design and set up the back-end data processing systems to host field data. Data has to be hosted at agency’s side with restricted access, along with password protection given to the department officials. The agency shall ensure preliminary filters for identifying respondent records that require validation. It will also design and set-up systems for data analysis and reporting for pre-decided variables and summary statistics, including visualization.

**2.8 Quality Assurance:** The agency shall develop and adhere to a quality assurance protocol which ensures appropriate quality checks at the:

1. village level where data is collected from respondent and uploaded;
2. district/regional levels where first level of monitoring is done
3. state level where the compiled data is analyzed.

The agency shall design and set-up concurrent data analysis and reporting system for pre-agreed variables and summary statistics. In addition to the agency, concurrent quality assurance checks and validation will be done by Government. The agency shall provide support to these teams, and cooperate with their efforts, and take required action to address any irregularities to the satisfaction of the government.

**2.9 Reports:** The agency shall be responsible for final data processing including running internal parity checks. The agency shall produce detailed independent verification reports on progress made by all the districts on ODF outcomes, as per approved report format(s).

The institute shall undertake the above tasks directly or by engaging partner firms/agencies. In case of engaging partners, their organizational details must be attached along with the technical proposal for technical evaluation. No partners or sub-contractors can be added at a later stage.

1. **REQUIRED QUALIFICATIONS**

**3.1 Firm Qualifications:**

The institute may associate with other firms or organizations to enhance qualifications. Following are the required qualifications.

* Minimum 5 year experience in conducting large scale surveys of rural households, familiarity with rural sanitation and hygiene and using electronic data collection instruments is an advantage
* Minimum 3 years of experience in organizing and planning survey logistics, data management and statistics.
* Availability of appropriate skills among staff (trainers, enumerators, supervisors,).

**3.2 Key Personnel:** Complete CVs for the following four positions, specifying their relevant educational qualifications, experience and language skills must be included in the technical proposal. Providing incomplete details may result in disqualification. These key personnel would be expected to be fully available and closely involved in the study process as per the commitments in the technical proposal.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Position** | **Minimum required inputs** | **Qualification** | **Language Skills** |
| Project Coordinator/Team Leader | 1 person for 50 days per year for two years  = 100 days | * At least postgraduate or higher qualification in Economics, Statistics, Mathematics, Public Health, Demography, and Social, Natural or Medical Sciences or equivalent * Minimum eight (8) years of experience in surveys, preferably in rural areas, including design, coordination, collection and analysis of data * Experience in leading multi-disciplinary survey teams. * Experience in managing surveys in rural sanitation or related sectors, is an advantage. | * Fluent in English and Hindi; fluency in Punjabi is an asset |
| Statistician | 1 person for 50 days per year for two years  = 100 days | * At least Post Graduate or higher Degree in Statistics, Economics, Mathematics or other relevant field from an accredited college or university. * Minimum eight (8) years of professional research experience, preferably on quantitative studies with a strong command of quantitative research software (e.g. SPSS, etc.) and demonstrated proficiency in conducting quantitative research. * Proficient in multivariate analysis and in analyzing large data sets. * Excellent ability to communicate complex technical material, both orally and in writing. | * Fluent in English; fluency in Hindi/Punjabi is an asset |
| Data Analyst | 1 person for 50 days per year for two years  = 100 days | * At least Post Graduate or higher Degree in from an accredited college or university * Minimum three (3) years of professional experience, preferably on quantitative studies with a strong command of quantitative research software (e.g. SPSS, etc.) and demonstrated proficiency in conducting quantitative analysis. * Proficient in multivariate analysis and in analyzing large data sets. | * Fluent in English; fluency in Hindi/Punjabi is an asset |
| Survey Coordinator (Total 3 nos; 1 person for 6 to 8 districts) | 3 person for 60 days per year for two years  =360 days | * Postgraduate in social science/rural development or similar from an accredited college or university * At least five years of experience coordinating large scale surveys at the field level, with some experience of using electronic devices * Experience in training to field investigators | * Fluent in Hindi and Punjabi |

Any additional staffing requirements will be left to the firm to determine based on the methodology and approach proposed. However, any CVs provided in addition to the above will not be considered as a part of the technical evaluation.

**3.3 Field Personnel:** After issuing the contract the institute is expected to mobilize the following team and share their CVs with the HOD, DWSS. CVs of these personnel need not be submitted along with the technical proposal. CVs, if submitted, will not be evaluated but a process of selection and training need to be detailed in the methodology which will be evaluated.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Position** | **Minimum required inputs** | **Qualification** | **Language Skills** |
| Field Supervisor | Institute to propose numbers as per the methodology and timeline | * Postgraduate diploma/degree in social science/rural development or similar * At least three years of experience supervising large scale surveys at the field level, with some experience of using electronic devices | * Fluent in Hindi/ Punjabi |
| Field Investigators/ Surveyors | Institute to propose numbers as per the methodology and timeline | * Graduate in social science/rural development or similar * Demonstrated prior experience in surveys at the field level, with some experience of using electronic devices | * Fluent in Hindi/ Punjabi |

1. **DELIVERABLES AND PAYMENT TERMS**

The institute should propose an implementation work plan that enables completion of two round of survey in three months each. It is proposed that the preparatory works shall be completed during July 2018 – August 2018 and the first round of survey shall be undertaken September 2018 to November 2018 and the second round shall be scheduled during September 2019 to November 2019.

This contract will be lump sum inclusive of all expenses and payments will be made against deliverables as detailed below.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **No** | **Deliverables** | **Timeline** | **Payment** |
| 1 | Signing of contract and kick off meeting completed Inception Report prepared with the following attachments and finalized in consultation with key stakeholders and approved by the department   * Detailed Work Plan * Detailed Sampling Protocol/Plan * Data Collection Instruments | 2nd week July, 2018 | **5%** |
| 2 | Field team selected, trained and deployed as per the approved methodology for the first annual round of field sample verification. (selection and training shall be done with prior notice to the department for their information/inputs) | Last week of August 2018 | **5%** |
| 3 | First annual round of field survey completed covering minimum 1000 villages and ensuring quality control requirements. Also, all required data collection reports mentioned in clause 2.6 along with raw data submitted and accepted by the department  (under this milestone partial payment shall be allowed on pro rata basis at the rate 2% of contract amount for 100 villages) | 1st week of November 2018 | **20%** |
| 4 | Data of first round of the survey fully analyzed and reports prepared as per the agreed formats and accepted by the department. This shall include separate reports for each district and consolidated report for the state | 1st week of December 2018 | **15%** |
| 5 | Work Plan for second year developed and agreed; necessary modifications of methodology developed; field team selected, trained and deployed as per the approved methodology for the second annual round of field survey. (selection and training shall be done with prior notice to the department for their information/inputs) | Last week of August 2019 | **10%** |
| 6 | Second annual round of field survey completed covering minimum 1000 villages and ensuring quality control requirements. Also, all required data collection reports mentioned in clause 2.6 along with raw data submitted and accepted by the department  (under this milestone partial payment shall be allowed on pro rata basis at the rate 2% of contract amount for 100 villages) | 1st week of November 2019 | **20%** |
| 7 | Data of the second round of the survey fully analyzed and reports prepared as per the agreed formats and accepted by the department. This shall include separate reports for each district and consolidated report for the state. | 1st week of December 2019 | **15%** |
| 8 | Completion report prepared with detailed analysis of both annual rounds and recommendations for sustainability of the ODF campaign. | Last week of January 2020 | **10%** |

1. **OTHER TERMS AND CONDITIONS**
   1. **Evaluation Criteria**
2. Capacity, skills and proven ability of the key personnel proposed.

* Project Coordinator/Team Leader – **10 Marks**
* Statistician– **10 Marks**
* Data Analyst– **5 Marks**
* Survey Coordinators -3 Nos (5 marks each) – **15 Marks**

1. Appropriateness of the technical proposal and methodology, including approach to address delays and risks to timely completion and quality assurance– **20 Marks**
2. Experience of the institute or partners in facilitating large scale survey program - **10 Marks**
3. Experience of the institute or partners in analyzing and reporting large scale survey data- **15 Marks**
4. Proposal showing an in-depth understanding of the rural sanitation sector in Punjab - **15 Marks**

Qualify.

Qualifying passing marks: 70

* 1. **Reporting**

The institute shall carry out this assignment under the overall guidance of Head DWSS. The HoD DWSS will review and that shall approve the measurement protocol for verification of progress, including survey methodology, and the structure of reports.

* 1. **Logistical Support**

The institute is responsible for all logistics, including but not limited to transport, lodging, supplies, translations, phones, computers, and so forth. The State/district will not provide logistical support for the study team. Therefore the financial proposal shall inclusive of all logistical requirements. Availing any kind of logistical support from the districts shall be considered as misconduct and could lead to disciplinary actions, to avoid any cases of favoritism.

* 1. **Ownership and Confidentiality of Data**

All information, reports and plans, both print and electronic, as well as the system that may have been designed specifically for this survey, in any format, will belong to the department and are strictly confidential. The institute may not use the data for their own research purposes, nor license/authorize the data to be used by others. Ethical considerations in research will be followed by the institute, including non-disclosure of personal information of respondents, freedom to not participate in the survey, use of local language, and other considerations that protect the respondents.